## East Greenbush Central School District



#### ADMINISTRATION CENTER

29 Englewood Avenue
East Greenbush, New York 12061
Phone (518) 207-2535 • Fax (518) 477-8124

#### Lawrence A. Edson, Jr.

Assistant Superintendent for School Business Finance

TO:

Jeffrey P. Simons, Superintendent of Schools

FROM:

Larry Edson, Assistant Superintendent for School Business Finance

MaryAnn Belmont, Transportation Supervisor

DATE:

October 1, 2019

RE:

Status of Transportation Department School Bus Fleet

During the annual budget process, there is a comprehensive review of the transportation department school bus fleet. The initial review is completed by Ms. Belmont, Transportation Supervisor, in conjunction with her staff. Subsequently, any proposals for new or replacement vehicles are considered by the Assistant Superintendent for School Business Finance and then the Superintendent of Schools. The Board of Education, after its own review, authorizes voter propositions for bus purchases by borrowing and from the bus purchase reserve. Residents have the opportunity to vote on bus purchase propositions at the annual budget vote in May.

## **FLEET OBJECTIVES**

Please be advised of the following objectives with regard to the school bus fleet, steps being taken to fulfill those objectives, and other accomplishments:

## 1) Provide safe transportation to and from school for all students

Status: It is a continuous objective of the transportation department to provide safe transportation. The department strives to meet all federal and state regulations, hire the most qualified staff, and provide professional development to all drivers on a semi-annual basis.

# 2) Standardize fleet purchases for optimal maintenance and purchasing of replacement parts

Status: There are three manufacturers of the 103 school buses within the fleet as of October 1, 2019: International (70), Girardin (8), and TransTech (25). Newer buses are being purchased on New York State Contract or by a bid process.

### 3) Track repair cost for each bus in the fleet

Status: The transportation department utilizes Bus Hive software to track all repairs made on each bus, including mileage, labor and inventory. The software information is used to determine trade-in points for buses, service timelines, and identify service issues.

# 4) Work to attain a 100% NYS Department of Transportation safety inspection rate

Status: For the last State reporting period of April 1, 2018 to March 31, 2019, the department achieved a 99.2% Department of Transportation pass rate. DOT reported that the District's commendable performance indicated a strong dedication to safety and a commitment to sound maintenance standards and practices.

## 5) Review spare bus capacity in light of student transport needs and industry standards

Status: By June 30, 2019, there were 21 spare buses in the 103 school bus fleet, a 20.4% ratio. For the 2019-2020 school year, there are 25 spare buses in the fleet for a 24.3% spare ratio. This somewhat exceeds the 15% to 20% industry standard quoted in the Shared Services Study by Transportation Advisory Services due to recent efficiency routing. One additional trade-in has been placed in the 2020-2021 bus purchase proposal to reduce spare bus capacity. We will await the outcome of potential start time changes prior to reducing spare capacity further.

## 6) Evaluate replacement of buses in the fleet against industry standards

Status: Several factors are taken into consideration for a proposal to replace buses, not just industry standards alone. Each bus must be evaluated in terms of body condition, total mileage, and repair expenses over time. Normally, small buses have an expected life of eight to ten years, while larger buses may last twelve to fifteen years. The transportation department also evaluates the benefits of newer buses in terms of fuel efficiency, lower emissions, engine control, and child and driver safety features.

#### 7) Timely apply for state aid reimbursement on bus purchases

Status: Subsequent to each purchase of a school bus, the District files form SA-16 to claim state transportation aid. SA-16 forms have been submitted electronically to SED for buses purchased in 2018-2019 and 2019-2020.

# 8) Utilize reserve funds whenever possible to avoid legal and interest expenses associated with borrowing

Status: The voters of the District approved a proposition to establish a new bus purchase reserve fund on May 15, 2018. The District intends to utilize the reserve fund as much as possible to avoid future borrowing costs.

#### **FLEET STATUS**

At the end of the current fiscal year, June 30, 2020, the District is anticipated to have the following school buses on hand:

66 Passenger Buses	58
28-30 Passenger 4Wheel Drive Buses	5
28-30 Passenger Buses	25
22 Passenger Buses	8
Wheelchair Equipped Buses	7
Total Buses in Fleet	103

Fleet size in the future may increase or decrease dependent upon enrollment and the anticipated number of regular routes.

## **FLEET REPLACEMENT PLAN**

The District has historically had a successful voter-supported replacement plan. The current year and proposed fleet replacement plan is as follows:

## 2019-2020 Budget Year

## Purchases (all from reserve):

- 4 Sixty-six passenger buses, Total Cost Net of Trade-Ins: \$446,749
- 4 Thirty passenger buses, Total Cost Net of Trade-Ins: \$241,729

#### Trade-Ins:

- 1 2005 International, sixty-six passenger
- 3 2006 International, sixty-six passenger
- 1 2009 GMC, thirty passenger, 4 wheel drive
- 1 2009 GMC, wheel-chair multiple station bus
- 2 2009 GMC, thirty passenger

#### Fleet Size:

Beginning of Year - 103 buses, 2 service vehicles End of Year - 103 buses, 2 service vehicles

### 2020-2021 Budget Year

### Planned Purchases (all from reserve):

- 4 Sixty-six passenger buses, Total Estimated Cost \$459,012
- 2 Thirty-five passenger buses, Total Estimated Cost \$136,304
- 1 Thirty passenger bus 4 wheel drive, Total Estimated Cost \$80,323
- 1 Twenty-two passenger bus, Total Estimated Cost \$60,431

#### Planned Trade-Ins:

- 5 2008 International (Navistar), sixty-six passenger (#243,244, 245, 246, 248)
- 2 2010 Chevrolet, thirty passenger (#630, 631)
- 1 2009 GMC, thirty passenger (#626)
- 1 2009 GMC, thirty passenger 4 wheel drive (#629)

#### Fleet Size:

Beginning of Year - 103 buses, 2 service vehicles End of Year - 102 buses, 2 service vehicles

## 2021-2022 Budget Year

#### Planned Purchases:

- 4 Sixty-six passenger buses, Total Estimated Cost \$476,504
- 2 Thirty-five passenger buses, Total Estimated Cost \$142,670
- 1 Thirty passenger 4 wheel drive, Total Estimated Cost \$83,812
- 1 Twenty-two passenger bus, Total Estimated Cost \$63,422

#### Planned Trade-Ins:

- 1 2008 International, sixty-six passenger (#247)
- 3 2009 International, sixty-six passenger (#249,251, 252)
- 2 2010 Chevrolet, thirty passenger (#632, 633)
- 2 2010 Chevrolet, thirty passenger 4 wheel drive (#634, 635)

#### Fleet Size:

Beginning of Year - 102 buses, 2 service vehicles End of Year - 102 buses, 2 service vehicles

#### 2022-2023 Budget Year

#### Planned Purchases:

- 4 Sixty-six passenger buses
- 2 Wheelchair buses
- 2 Thirty passenger buses

#### Planned Trade-Ins:

- 2 2009 International, sixty-six passenger (#250, 253)
- 2 2010 International, sixty-six passenger (#254, 255)
- 2 2014 International AE, wheelchair buses (#636, 637)
- 2 2014 International AE, thirty passenger (#640,641)

#### Fleet Size:

Beginning of Year - 102 buses, 2 service vehicles End of Year - 102 buses, 2 service vehicles

#### **SPARE CAPACITY**

The District has calculated its spare capacity as follows:

	Total Buses (A)	Regular Routes (B)	Regular Trips (C)	Spares (D)	Spare Percent (D)/(A)
June 30, 2019	103	75	7	21	20.4%
June 30, 2020*	103	71	7	25	24.3%
June 30, 2021*	102	71	7	24	23.5%

Note that buses under column (C) are used on a regular daily basis for trips to athletic competitions or approved educational field trips. Therefore, they are not technically available to be used as spare buses. An asterisk denotes projected spare percent calculations.

The August 2010 report issued by Transportation Advisory Services (TAS) for the Rensselaer Student Transportation Collective indicated that our spare capacity exceeded the industry standard of 15 to 20 percent. However, in questioning TAS, they note that the spare capacity is derived from their experience in consulting with school districts rather than a published industry standard. Despite this information, we reviewed the spare status in the District and believed their comments to have some merit. Accordingly, we made efforts over the past few years to reduce spares so the 20.4% ratio for 2018-2019 would be right near the TAS quoted industry standard.

The spare capacity varies from year to year dependent on the number of regular routes established by the Transportation Supervisor. Over time, the number of regular routes has declined due to lower student enrollment and routing efficiencies.

There was only need for 71 regular routes this year, which increased the spare capacity. The plan is to reduce spares by one in the 2020-2021 school year, and subsequently continue to reduce spares dependent upon enrollment and routes needed to accommodate possible changing start times.

#### **BUS PURCHASE RESERVE**

The success of the replacement plan has been complemented with the use of funding from capital reserves (bus purchase reserves), established in 1994 and 2010, which are now closed. A new bus purchase reserve was authorized by voters during the May 15, 2018 school vote.

The benefits of utilizing the capital reserve method to fund buses are as follows:

- Creation of a funding stream for future purchases: State transportation aid received on prior bus purchases must be deposited in the capital reserve that can only be used to buy more buses.
- 2) Save taxpayer dollars: Borrowing is typically a costly alternative to using capital reserve funds. When the District borrows to purchase buses, it incurs legal and interest expenses.
- 3) Voter control of funding: Only the voters of the District can authorize deposits to the reserve (through state aid) and withdrawals from the reserve (as part of a proposition at the annual vote for bus purchases).
- 4) Flexibility: The 2018 capital reserve allows additional discretionary funding each year when financial conditions are favorable. The additional funding further offsets the need to borrow when purchases are made.

On May 15, 2018, the voters of the East Greenbush Central School District approved the following proposition #4:

RESOLVED: That the Board of Education of the East Greenbush Central School District is authorized to establish a reserve fund pursuant to the Education Law Section 3651, to be known as the 2018 Bus Purchase Reserve Fund, for the purchase of school buses and related equipment and expense, in an ultimate amount not to exceed \$5,000,000-plus interest earnings and for a probable term of 15 years. The Board is authorized; to pay into the fund in the 2017-2018 school year and annually thereafter available funds of the District in an amount determined by the Board, including state aid reimbursement to the District on account of bus purchases and the proceeds of the sale of used buses, as well as the remaining balance from the 2010 Bus Purchase Reserve Fund which will be transferred to the 2018 Bus Purchase Reserve-Fund no later than June 30, 2019 and such other monies as the voters may direct.

## 2010 Bus Purchase Activity (Reserve Now Closed)

<u>Year</u>	Beginning <u>Balance</u>	Optional <u>Funding</u>	State <u>Aid</u>	Bus <u>Purchase</u>	Ending <u>Balance</u>
2017-18	\$606,331	\$200,000	\$465,557	\$557,597 \$221,938 by	\$714,291 udget purchase
2018-19	\$714,291	\$0	\$25	\$634,627	\$79,689 transfer

## 2018 Bus Purchase Reserve Activity (Estimated)

<u>Year</u>	Beginning Balance	Optional Funding (1)	State Aid (2)	Bus Purchase (3)	Ending Balance (4)
2019-20 2020-21	\$79,689 \$843,722 \$922,789	\$200,000 \$250,000 \$250,000	\$564,033 \$517,545 \$488,026	\$0 \$688,478 \$736,070	\$843,722 \$922,789 \$924,745
2021-22	\$924,745	\$250,000	\$464,424	\$766,408	\$872,761

#### Notes:

- (1) Optional funding under the 2010 reserve was limited to \$200,000 per fiscal year. Under the 2018 new reserve, the \$200,000 limit per year was removed. Optional funding is always at the Board's discretion and dependent upon the District's overall financial condition.
- (2) State aid is paid over a five-year period based on a formula related to bus purchases. The state aid estimates above also includes interest generated on the reserve fund.
- (3) Bus purchases for 2020-2021 are conditional upon a positive vote on proposition #2 set for a resident vote on May 19, 2020. Bus purchases are estimated for 2020-2021 in accordance with the fleet replacement plan above.
- (4) The beginning balance in the reserve, plus optional funding and state aid, and less bus purchases equals the ending balance in each fiscal year. Note the remaining balance in the 2010 reserve at March 31, 2019 of \$79,689 was transferred to the new 2018 reserve. If the District maintains the optional funding amounts suggested, there may not be a need to borrow for bus purchases in the next three years.

If you have questions on this information, please contact Mr. Edson or Ms. Belmont for further clarification

## Appendix A: Bus Fleet as of September 17, 2019

Bus No.	Model Yr	Capacity	Make	Model	Assigned	Mileage
243 *	2008	66	Internati	IC	Spare	126,936
244 *	2008	66	Internati	IC	Spare	131,985
245 *	2008	66	Internati	IC	Spare	122,979
246 *	2008	66	Internati	IC	Spare	123,362
247 **	2008	66	Internati	IC	Spare	110,806
248 *	2008	66	Internati	IC	Spare	115,699
249 **	2009	66	Internati	IC	Spare	146,022
250	2009	66	Internati	IC	Trips	116,948
251 **	2009	66	Internati	IC	Trips	133,724
252 **	2009	66	Internatl	IC	Trips	142,446
253	2009	66	Internati	IC	Trips	140,122
254	2010	66	Internati	IC	Trips	134,414
255	2010	66	Internati	IC	Trips	136,726
256	2010	66	Internati	IC	Trips	109,227
257	2010	66	Internati	IC	Spare	131,446
258	2010	66	Internati	IC	Spare	141,092
259	2012	66	Internati	IC	Spare	115,070
260	2012	66	Internati	IC	Spare	110,579
261	2012	66	Internati	IC	Route	121,805
262	2012	66	Internati	IC	Spare	124,062
263	2012	66	Internati	IC	Spare	131,187
264	2012	66	Internati	IC	Route	110,719

Bus No.	Model Yr	Capacity	Make	Model	Assigned	Mileage
265	2012	66	Internati	IC	Route	88,664
266	2014	66	Internati	IC	Route	67,904
267	2014	66	Internati	IC	Route	71,035
268	2014	66	Internati	IC	Route	77,501
269	2014	66	Internati	IC	Route	98,401
270	2014	66	Internati	IC	Route	78,012
271	2014	66	Internati	IC	Route	84,087
272	2015	66	Internati	IC	Route	62,447
273	2015	66	Internati	IC	Route	72,650
274	2015	66	Internati	IC	Route	65,379
275	2015	66	Internati	IC	Route	71,495
276	2015	66	Internati	IC	Route	81,346
277	2015	66	Internati	IC	Route	70,601
278	2016	66	Internatl	1C	Route	62,063
279	2016	66	Internati	IC	Route	59,739
280	2016	66	Internati	IC	Route	57,439
281	2016	66	Internati	IC	Route	69,578
282	2016	66	Internati	IC	Route	62,924
283	2016	66	Internati	IC	Route	56,265
284	2017	66	Internati	IC	Route	45,609
285	2017	66	Internati	IC	Route	48,695
286	2017	-66	Internati	IC	Route	41,399
287	2017	66	Internati	IC	Route	37,360
288	2017	66	Internati	IC	Route	42,432

Bus No.	Model Yr	Capacity	Make	Model	Assigned	Mileage
289	2017	66	Internati	IC	Route	46,865
290	2018	66	Internati	IC	Route	38,136
291	2018	66	Internati	IC	Route	34,325
292	2018	66	Internati	IC	Route	33,595
293	2018	66	Internati	IC	Route	30,527
294	2019	66	Internati	IC	Route	15,630
295	2019	66	Internati	IC	Route	18,038
296	2019	66	Internati	IC	Route	13,967
297	2020	66	Internati	IC	Route	1,956
298	2020	66	Internati	IC	Route	2,075
299	2020	66	Internati	IC	Route	2,091
300	2020	66	Internati	IC	Route	2,020
626 *	2009	30	GMC	Girardin	Spare	167,256
629 *	2009	30/4 WD	GMC	Girardin	Spare	170,735
630 *	2010	30	Chevrolet	Girardin	Spare	149,190
631 *	2010	30	Chevrolet	Girardin	Spare	160,017
632 **	2010	30	Chevrolet	Girardin	Spare	141,768
633 **	2010	30	Chevrolet	Girardin	Spare	146,340
634 **	2010	30/4 WD	Chevrolet	Girardin	Spare	136,631
635 **	2010	30/4 WD	Chevrolet	Girardin	Spare	159,868
636	2014	18/ 2 WC	Internati	AE	Route	72,413
637	2014	24/1 WC	Internati	AE	Spare	50,458
638	2014	18/2 WC	Internati	AE	Route	84,748
639	2014	18/2 WC	Internati	AE	Spare	60,978

Bus No.	Model Yr	Capacity	Make	Model	Assigned	Mileage
640	2014	30	Internati	AE	Spare	88,991
641	2014	30	Internati	AE	Spare	102,470
642	2014	30	Internati	AE	Route	96,560
643	2014	30	Internati	AE	Route	114,415
644	2015	18/2 WC	Internati	AE	Spare	65,999
645	2015	30/0 WC	Internati	AE	Route	66,589
646	2015	22	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	124,203
647	2015	22	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	92,363
648	2015	22	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	74,182
649	2015	22	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	64,154
650	2014	30	Internatl	AE	Route	76,056
651	2014	30	Internati	AE	Route	62,534
652	2016	28/4 WD	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	71,415
653	2016	28/4 WD	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	63,372
654	2016	30	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	56,571
655	2016	30	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	60,288
656	2017	28	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	43,790
657	2017	28	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	38,653
658	2017	28	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	43,331
659	2017	28	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	43,630
660	2017	22	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	42,802
661	2017	22	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	38,913
662	2018	28	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	23,073
663	2018	28	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	25,253

Bus No.	Model Yr	Capacity	Make	Model	Assigned	Mileage
664	2018	28	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	25,698
665	2018	28	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	29,478
667	2018	22	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	23,403
668	2018	18/1WC	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	21,088
669	2018	22	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	16,916
670	2019	30	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	1,473
671	2019	30	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	421
672	2019	30	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	953
673	2019	30	Chevrolet	Trans	Route	1,362

## Appendix B - Service Vehicles as of September 17, 2019

Veh. No.	Model Yr	Capacity	Make	Model	Assigned	Mileage
S-1	2017	3	Ford	F350	Service	3,510
S-2	2009	5	Chevrolet	-Impala	Service	36,281

### Notes:

Trade-Ins Expected During 2022-2023 School Year - Buses Not Selected Yet Bus 645 is an adjustable floor plan wheelchair bus that has been adjusted to seat 30 passengers with no wheelchair station. It was necessary to adjust for routing needs.

## Abbreviations:

WD - Wheel Drive

WC - Wheelchair Equipped Bus

AE - Model Description of Smaller International Buses, Typically Built on an Incomplete or Cutaway Van Chassis

IC - International Corporation (Navistar)

Trans - TransTech

<sup>\*</sup>Trade-Ins Expected During 2020-2021 School Year

<sup>\*\*</sup>Trade-Ins Expected During 2021-2022 School Year